

MATTHEW P. DENN ATTORNEY GENERAL DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE NEW CASTLE COUNTY 820 NORTH FRENCH STREET WILMINGTON, DELAWARE 19801 CIVIL DIVISION (302) 577-8400 FAX (302) 577-6630 CRIMINAL DIVISION (302) 577-8500 FAX (302) 577-2496 FRAUD DIVISION (302) 577-8600 FAX (302) 577-6499

The Honorable Scott Pruitt, Administrator U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Ariel Rios Building 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20460

January 2, 2018

RE: Notice of Intent to Sue Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7604 for Failure to Perform Non-Discretionary Duty to Approve or Disapprove Delaware's Clean Air Act Section 126 Petition Regarding the Brunner Island Steam Electric Station, Located in York County, Pennsylvania

## Dear Administrator Pruitt:

The State of Delaware, Department of Natural Resources and Environmental Control respectfully gives notice of its intent to file suit against you pursuant to Section 304 of the Clean Air Act (42 U.S.C. § 7604) in your official capacity as the Administrator of the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) for failure to perform a non-discretionary duty under the Clean Air Act (CAA).

On July 7, 2016, EPA received Delaware's Section 126 Petition regarding the Brunner Island Steam Electric Station, which Petition requires that EPA make a finding whether the Brunner Island Steam Electric Station, located in York County, Pennsylvania, is operating in a manner that emits air pollution in violation of the provisions of Section 110(a)(2)(D)(i) of the CAA. Specifically, Delaware's Petition seeks a determination that the Brunner Island Steam Electric Station's electric generating units are emitting air pollutants in violation of the provisions of Section 110(a)(2)(D)(i) of the CAA with respect to the 2008 0.075 ppm ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standard (NAAQS) and the 2015 8-hour 0.070 ppm ozone NAAQS.

Congress recognized, through enactment of Section 126 of the CAA (42 U.S.C. § 7426), that interstate air pollution is a serious problem for downwind states that would otherwise have little authority to require sources of harmful air emissions in upwind states to reduce their emissions. Section 126 provides downwind states a mechanism to reach upwind sources by authorizing states and political subdivisions to petition the EPA "Administrator for a finding that any major source or group of sources emits or would emit any air pollutant in violation of the prohibition of section [7410(a)(2)(D)(i)]<sup>1</sup> of [the CAA] or this section." If the Administrator makes such a finding, the Administrator then has the authority under Section 126(c) to require the upwind source to modify its operations or cease operating to bring about compliance.

Section 126(b) imposes a non-discretionary duty on the Administrator and EPA to act on such petitions within 60 days of receipt: "Within 60 days after receipt of any petition under [subsection 126(b) of the CAA] and after public hearing, the Administrator shall make such finding or deny the petition." EPA, however, has failed to perform its non-discretionary duty to act on Delaware's Section 126 Petition regarding Brunner Island Steam Electric Station within the required 60 days. Instead, as is EPA's customary practice, on August 23, 2016, EPA, relying on CAA Section 307(d)(10) (42 U.S.C. 7607(d)(10)), granted itself a 6-month deferral to act on Delaware's Section 126 Petition concerning Brunner Island Steam Electric Station.<sup>2</sup> (See 81 FR 57461). This 6-month deferral has since expired, and EPA has failed to take any action on Delaware's Section 126 Petition regarding Brunner Island Steam Electric Station.<sup>3</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Delaware notes that the cross-reference to section 7410(a)(2)(D)(ii) in Section 126(b) has been determined to be a scrivener's error and the correct cross-reference in this provision is to section 7410(a)(2)(D)(i). *GenOn REMA, LLC v. U.S. E.P.A.*, 722 F.3d 513, 517 n. 3 (3d Cir. 2013) (citing *Appalachian Power Co. v. E.P.A.*, 249 F.3d 1032, 1040-44 (D.C. Cir. 2001)).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Delaware is presently challenging EPA's application of 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d)(10) to Section 126 Petitions in the Circuit Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit (C.A. No. 17-1644) and the D.C. Circuit Court of Appeals (C.A. No.:17-1099). Delaware maintains that EPA's practice of granting itself a 6-month deferral is contrary to law, because § 7607(d)(10) only applies where EPA has first issued a proposed rule. EPA, however, has not issued a proposed rule or finding in response to Delaware's Section 126 Petitions, and therefore, EPA lacks the statutory authority to defer acting on Delaware's Section 126 Petition for 6-months.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See Docket ID No. EPA-HQ-OAR-2016-0402.

Despite EPA's clear statutory obligation to act on Delaware's Section 126
Petition regarding Brunner Island Steam Electric Station within 60 days of receipt, EPA
has not acted on the Petition, other than to grant itself the 6-month deferral.
Consequently, the State of Delaware is writing to provide notice that it intends to file suit against Administrator Pruitt and the EPA for failing to perform their non-discretionary duty to timely act on Delaware's Section 126 Petition regarding Brunner Island Steam Electric.

This letter provides notice, as required by Section 304 of the CAA (42 U.S.C. § 7604) and 40 C.F.R. Part 54. In keeping with the requirements of the federal regulations, you are hereby notified that the names and addresses of the parties giving the notice are as shown below.

Unless EPA takes the required actions before the end of the applicable notice period, the State of Delaware intends to bring suit against Administrator Pruitt and EPA in the United States District Court for the District of Delaware pursuant to Section 304 of the CAA for Administrator Pruitt's and EPA's failure to perform their non-discretionary duties outlined in Section 126.

Regards,

STATE OF DELAWARE, DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

William J. Kassab (DE Bar Id. No. 5914)

Deputy Attorney General

Delaware Department of Justice 820 North French Street, 6<sup>th</sup> Floor

Wilmington Delaware 19801

Wilmington, Delaware 19801

Counsel for State of Delaware,

Department of Natural Resources &

Environmental Control

Cc: The Honorable Jeff Sessions
United States Attorney General
U.S. Department of Justice
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20530-0001

\*Continued on following page.

The Honorable Tom Wolf Office of the Governor 508 Main Capitol Building Harrisburg, PA 17120

Krishnan Ramamurthy Director, Bureau of Air Quality PA Department of Environmental Protection P.O. Box 8468 Harrisburg, PA 17105-8468

Cosmo Servidio Administrator, U.S. E.P.A. Region III Office 1650 Arch Street Mail Code: 3RA00 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2029

Correspondence Control Unit Office of General Counsel (2311) U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW. Washington, DC 20460

Homer City Generating Station Homer City Holdings LLC Registered Agent: The Corporation Trust Company Corporation Trust Center 1209 Orange Street Wilmington, DE 19801