UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

)
)
CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY)
351 California St., Suite 600)
San Francisco, CA 94104)
)
Plaintiff,)
)
v.) Civ. No
)
GINA McCARTHY)
in her Official Capacity as)
Administrator,)
United States Environmental Protection Agency)
Ariel Rios Building)
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.)
Washington, DC 20460,)
)
Defendant.)
)

COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Plaintiff the Center for Biological Diversity brings this Clean Air Act citizen suit to compel the United States Environmental Protection Agency to undertake overdue mandatory duties. Specifically, Defendant, Gina McCarthy, in her official capacity as Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), has failed to promulgate Federal Implementation Plans under 42 U.S.C. § 7410(c)(1)(A) for the following states for the following elements of the Infrastructure Statement Implementation Plans for the 2006 PM2.5 NAAQS:

STATE	ELEMENTS
Puerto Rico	Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M);
Iowa	Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M);
Washington	Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M)

Accordingly, Plaintiff THE CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY brings this action against Defendant GINA McCARTHY, in her official capacity as EPA Administrator, to compel her to perform her mandatory duties.

II. JURISDICTION

2. This is a Clean Air Act citizen suit. Therefore, the Court has jurisdiction over this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 (federal question jurisdiction) and 42 U.S.C. § 7604(a)(2) (citizen suits for failure to perform a non-discretionary duty required by the Clean Air Act). An actual controversy exists between the parties. This case does not concern federal taxes, is not a proceeding under 11 U.S.C. §§ 506 or 1146, and does not involve the Tariff Act of 1930. Thus, this Court has authority to order the declaratory relief requested under 28 U.S.C. § 2201. If the Court orders declaratory relief, 28 U.S.C. § 2202 authorizes this Court to issue injunctive relief.

III. NOTICE

3. On January 9, 2014, Plaintiff mailed to EPA by certified mail, return receipt requested, written notice of intent to sue regarding the violations alleged in this Complaint. More than sixty days have passed since Plaintiff mailed this "notice of intent to sue" letter. EPA has not remedied the violations alleged in this Complaint. Therefore, a present and actual controversy exists.

IV. VENUE

4. This civil action is brought against an officer of the United States acting in her official capacity. EPA is headquartered in this judicial district. Defendant Gina McCarthy officially resides in the District of Columbia. Accordingly, venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e).

V. PARTIES

5. Plaintiff the CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY is a non-profit 501(c)(3) corporation incorporated in California. The Center for Biological Diversity has over 50,000 members throughout the United States and the world. The Center for Biological Diversity's mission is to ensure the preservation, protection, and restoration of biodiversity, native species, ecosystems, public lands and waters, and public health through science, policy, and environmental law. Based on the understanding that the health and vigor of human societies and the integrity and wildness of the natural environment are closely linked, the Center for Biological Diversity is working to secure a future for animals and plants hovering on the brink of extinction, for the ecosystems they need to survive, and for a healthy, livable future for all of us.

- 6. The Center for Biological Diversity and its members include individuals with varying interests in wildlife species and their habitat ranging from scientific, professional, educational, recreational, aesthetic, moral, and spiritual. Further, the Center for Biological Diversity's members enjoy, on an ongoing basis, the biological, scientific, research, educational, conservation, recreational, and aesthetic values of the regions inhabited by these species, including the regions at issue in this action. The Center for Biological Diversity's members observe and study native species and their habitat, and derive professional, scientific, educational, recreational, aesthetic, inspirational, and other benefits from these activities and have an interest in preserving the possibility of such activities in the future. The Center for Biological Diversity and its members have participated in efforts to protect and preserve natural areas, including the habitat essential to the continued survival of native species, and to address threats to the continued existence of these species, including the threats posed by air pollution and other contaminants.
- 7. Plaintiff's members live, work, recreate, travel and engage in other activities throughout the areas at issue in this complaint and will continue to do so on a regular basis. Pollution in the affected areas threatens and damages, and will continue to threaten and damage, the health and welfare of Plaintiff's members as well as their ability to engage in and enjoy their other activities. Pollution diminishes Plaintiff's members' ability to enjoy the aesthetic qualities and recreational opportunities of the affected area.
- 8. The Clean Air Act violation alleged in this Complaint also deprive the Center for Biological Diversity and its members of certain procedural rights, including notice and opportunity to comment, associated with EPA's failure to promulgate Federal Implementation Plans. The Clean Air Act violation alleged in this Complaint also deprive the Center for

Biological Diversity and its members of certain information which they are entitled to under the Clean Air Act.

- 9. The Clean Air Act violations alleged in this Complaint have injured and will continue to injure the interests of Plaintiff's organization and its members, unless and until this Court grants the requested relief. Granting the relief requested in this lawsuit would address these injuries by compelling EPA action to perform its mandatory duties, thereby improving air quality and reducing the risk of exposure to air pollution and the uncertainty regarding that exposure.
- The above injuries will continue until the Court grants the relief requested in this
 Complaint.
- 11. Defendant GINA MCCARTHY is the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency. In that role Administrator McCarthy has been charged by Congress with the duty to administer the Clean Air Act, including the mandatory duties at issue in this case.

VI. LEGAL BACKGROUND

12. Congress enacted the Clean Air Act to "speed up, expand, and intensify the war against air pollution in the United States with a view to assuring that the air we breathe throughout the Nation is wholesome once again." H.R.Rep. No. 1146, 91st Cong., 2d Sess. 1,1, 1970 U.S.Code Cong. & Admin. News 5356, 5356. To promote this, the Act requires EPA to set National Ambient Air Quality Standards for certain pollutants. Each National Ambient Air Quality Standard must be stringent enough to protect public health and welfare. Effects on welfare include, but are not limited to, effects on soils, water, vegetation, manmade materials, wildlife, visibility (*i.e.*, haze), climate, damage to property, economic impacts and effects on personal

comfort and well-being. National Ambient Air Quality Standards establish maximum allowable concentrations in the air of these pollutants, including particulate matter.

- 13. The Clean Air Act requires each state to submit a state implementation plan for every promulgation or revision of a National Ambient Air Quality Standard, within three years of that standard's promulgation or revision, that provides for the "implementation, maintenance, and enforcement" of the standard. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(1). These are often referred to as "infrastructure" state implementation plans.
- 14. An infrastructure state implementation plan submittal must meet the requirements listed under 42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(2). *See* 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(a)(2)(A)-(M).
- 15. The Clean Air Act requires EPA to determine whether any state implementation plan submittal is administratively complete. *See* 42 U.S.C. 7410(k)(1)(B). If a state fails to submit any required state implementation plan, there is no submittal that may be deemed administratively complete and EPA must make a determination stating that the state failed to submit the required state implementation plan. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B). This is referred to as a "finding of failure to submit."
- 16. If EPA finds that a state has failed to submit a SIP by a required deadline, EPA has a mandatory duty to promulgate a Federal Implementation Plan (FIP) within 2 years of that finding. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(c)(1).

VII. FACTS

17. In 2006, EPA promulgated a National Ambient Air Quality Standard for particulate matter. 71 Fed. Reg. 61,144 (Oct. 17, 2006).

- 18. States, as that term is used in the Clean Air Act which includes Puerto Rico, were required to submit Infrastructure SIPs addressing the 2006 PM2.5 NAAQS within 3 years, that is no later than October 17, 2009. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(a)(1). *See also* 76 Fed. Reg. 55,577, 55,578 (Sept. 8, 2011).
- 19. On September 8, 2011, EPA found that the following states had failed to submit the following elements of their 2006 PM2.5 Infrastructure SIP:

Puerto Rico failed to submit a SIP to satisfy the requirements of section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M);

Iowa failed to submit a SIP to satisfy the requirements of section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M);

Washington failed to submit for section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M).

76 Fed. Reg. at 55,579.

- 20. Since this finding, EPA has not yet approved any state implementation plan or revision from any of these states addressing these requirements.
- 21. Accordingly, EPA has a mandatory duty to promulgate a FIP addressing the requirements for the 2006 PM2.5 NAAQS for the above listed states by no later than October 11, 2013. EPA has failed to perform this mandatory duty.

VIII. CLAIM FOR RELIEF

CLAIM ONE

(Failure to promulgate Federal Implementation Plans)

22. Plaintiff incorporates by reference paragraphs 1 through 21.

- 23. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7410(c)(1), EPA has a mandatory duty to promulgate a FIP for 2006 PM2.5 infrastructure state implementation plans addressing for the following states for the following elements by no later than October 11, 2013: Puerto Rico Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M); Iowa Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M); and Washington Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M).
- 24. EPA has not promulgated FIPs and has not finally approved SIPs for Puerto Rico Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M); Iowa Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M); and Washington Section 110(a)(2)(A)–(C), (D)(i)(II) (PSD prong only), (E)–(H) and (J)–(M).
- 25. Therefore EPA has failed to perform the mandatory duties listed above.

IX. REQUEST FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, the Center for Biological Diversity respectfully requests that the Court:

- A. Declare that the Administrator is in violation of the Clean Air Act with regard to her failure to perform the mandatory duty listed above;
- B. Issue a mandatory injunction requiring the Administrator to perform her mandatory duty by a certain date;
- C. Retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of enforcing the Court's order;
- D. Grant the Center for Biological Diversity its reasonable costs of litigation, including attorneys' and expert witness fees; and
- E. Grant such further relief as the Court deems proper.

Respectfully submitted,

/s Robert Ukeiley

Robert Ukeiley DDC Bar No. MD 14062 Law Office of Robert Ukeiley 255 Mountain Meadows Road Boulder, CO 80302

Tel: (303) 442-4033 Fax: (866) 618-1017 Email: rukeiley@igc.org

Counsel for Center for Biological Diversity

Dated: February 24, 2015

Case 1:15-cv-00268 Document 1-1 Filed 02/24/15 Page 1 of 2

CIVIL COVER SHEET

JS-44 (Rev. 7/13 DC)									
I. (a) PLAINTIFFS]]	DEFENDA	NTS					
(b) COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF(EXCEPT IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASES) (c) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NAME, ADDRESS, AND TELEPHONE NUMBER)				LAND CONDE	(IN U.S. EMNATION C	. PLAIN	STED DEFENDANT FIFF CASES ONLY) THE LOCATION OF THE TRACT OF L	AND INVOLV	ED
II. BASIS OF JURISDICTION							ES (PLACE AN x IN ONE I	OX FOR	
(PLACE AN x IN ONE BOX ONLY)		LAINTIFF A	ND ONE BOX	PTF	DFT) <u>FOR D</u>	IVERSITY CASES ONLY!	PTF	DFT
	ederal Question S. Government Not a Party)	Citizen of thi	s State	O 1	O 1		orated or Principal Place iness in This State	O 4	O 4
Defendant (I	ndicate Citizenship of	Citizen of An	nother State	O 2	O 2		orated and Principal of Business in Another Stat	O 5	O 5
Pa		Citizen or Su Foreign Cour		O 3	O 3	Foreig	n Nation	O 6	O 6
	IV. CASE ASSIG	NMENT	AND NA	TURE (OF SUI	Т			
(Place an X in one cat	egory, A-N, that best represe			-			esponding Nature of S	uit)	
	ersonal Injury/ [alpractice rolane		Administ Review		gency		O D. Temporary Order/Preli Injunction		ining
315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel & Slander 330 Federal Employers Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability		861 862 863 864 865 <u>Other St</u> 891 893	Social Security 861 HIA (1395ff) 862 Black Lung (923) 863 DIWC/DIWW (405(g)) 864 SSID Title XVI 865 RSI (405(g)) Other Statutes 891 Agricultural Acts 893 Environmental Matters 890 Other Statutory Actions (If Administrative Agency is Involved)						
O E. General Civil (Other)	OR	0	F. Pro	Se Gene	ral Civ	il			
Bankruptcy 422 Appeal 27 USC 158 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 424 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 290 All Other Real Property 370 Other Fraud 371 Truth in Lending 380 Other Personal Property Damage 385 Property Damage Product Liability 422 Appeal 27 USC 158 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 423 Wi		ditions	Other Sta 375 I 400 S 430 I 450 G I 460 I 462 N 465 G	Orug Rela Property 2 Other	ms Act pportion Banking e/ICC on ntion on Influence	nment n	480 Consumer C 490 Cable/Satelli 850 Securities/Co Exchange 896 Arbitration 899 Administrati Act/Review of Agency Decis 950 Constitutions Statutes 890 Other Statute (if not admin review or Pri	te TV mmodition r Appeal ion ality of St ory Action istrative:	dure of ate ns agency

Case 1:15-cv-00268 Document 1-1 Filed 02/24/15 Page 2 of 2

O G. Habeas Corpus/ 2255	O H. Employment Discrimination	O I. FOIA/Privacy Act	O J. Student Loan
530 Habeas Corpus – General 510 Motion/Vacate Sentence 463 Habeas Corpus – Alien Detainee	442 Civil Rights – Employment (criteria: race, gender/sex, national origin, discrimination, disability, age, religion, retaliation)	895 Freedom of Information Act 890 Other Statutory Actions (if Privacy Act)	152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loan (excluding veterans)
	(If pro se, select this deck)	*(If pro se, select this deck)*	
O K. Labor/ERISA (non-employment) 710 Fair Labor Standards Act 720 Labor/Mgmt. Relations 740 Labor Railway Act 751 Family and Medical Leave Act 790 Other Labor Litigation 791 Empl. Ret. Inc. Security Act	O L. Other Civil Rights (non-employment) 441 Voting (if not Voting Rights Act) 443 Housing/Accommodations 440 Other Civil Rights 445 Americans w/Disabilities – Employment 446 Americans w/Disabilities – Other 448 Education	O M. Contract 110 Insurance 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Instrument 150 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholder's Suits 190 Other Contracts 195 Contract Product Liability 196 Franchise	O N. Three-Judge Court 441 Civil Rights – Voting (if Voting Rights Act)
V. ORIGIN			
O 1 Original O 2 Removed Proceeding from State Court	O 3 Remanded from Appellate Court Court Reopened		ti-district O 7 Appeal to gation District Judge from Mag. Judge
VI. CAUSE OF ACTION (CITE T	HE U.S. CIVIL STATUTE UNDER WHICH	YOU ARE FILING AND WRITE A BRI	EF STATEMENT OF CAUSE.)
VII. REQUESTED IN COMPLAINT	CHECK IF THIS IS A CLASS ACTION UNDER F.R.C.P. 23 DEMAND JU	Check Y YES Check Y YES	YES only if demanded in complaint NO
VIII. RELATED CASE(S) IF ANY	(See instruction) YES	NO If yes, p	lease complete related case form
DATE.	SIGNATURE OF ATTORNEY OF REC	_{rord} /s Robert Ukei	ley

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING CIVIL COVER SHEET JS-44 Authority for Civil Cover Sheet

The JS-44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replaces nor supplements the filings and services of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiating the civil docket sheet. Consequently, a civil cover sheet is submitted to the Clerk of Court for each civil complaint filed. Listed below are tips for completing the civil cover sheet. These tips coincide with the Roman Numerals on the cover sheet.

- I. COUNTY OF RESIDENCE OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF/DEFENDANT (b) County of residence: Use 11001 to indicate plaintiff if resident of Washington, DC, 88888 if plaintiff is resident of United States but not Washington, DC, and 99999 if plaintiff is outside the United States.
- III. CITIZENSHIP OF PRINCIPAL PARTIES: This section is completed <u>only</u> if diversity of citizenship was selected as the Basis of Jurisdiction under Section II.
- IV. CASE ASSIGNMENT AND NATURE OF SUIT: The assignment of a judge to your case will depend on the category you select that best represents the <u>primary</u> cause of action found in your complaint. You may select only <u>one</u> category. You <u>must</u> also select <u>one</u> corresponding nature of suit found under the category of the case.
- VI. CAUSE OF ACTION: Cite the U.S. Civil Statute under which you are filing and write a brief statement of the primary cause.
- VIII. RELATED CASE(S), IF ANY: If you indicated that there is a related case, you must complete a related case form, which may be obtained from the Clerk's Office.

Because of the need for accurate and complete information, you should ensure the accuracy of the information provided prior to signing the form.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

District of Columbia

District of Columbia			
Center for Biologic	al Diversity		
Plaintiff V.		Civil Action No.	
Gina McCa	rthy		
Defendani	<u> </u>		
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION	
To: (Defendant's name and address)	RONALD C. MACHEN, JR., United States Attorney's Off Judiciary Center Building 555 4th Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20530		
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.		
are the United States or a Unite P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an officer serve on the plaintiff an answ		
If you fail to respond, j You also must file your answer	•	ntered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.	
		ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT	
Date:		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk	
		Signature of Cierk of Deputy Clerk	

AO 440 (Rev. 12/09; DC 03/10) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (nan	ne of individual and title, if any)			
was re	ceived by me on (date)				
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individua	al at (place)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence o	r usual place of abode with (name)		
		, a perso	n of suitable age and discretion who resid	des there,	
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy t	to the individual's last known address; or		
	☐ I served the summo	ons on (name of individual)		,	who is
	designated by law to a	accept service of process on be	chalf of (name of organization)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the summ	mons unexecuted because			; or
	☐ Other (specify):				
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00) .
	I declare under penalty	y of perjury that this information	on is true.		
Date:			Server's signature		
			server's signature		
			Printed name and title		
			The same and the		
			Server's address		
			Deiver a uuuresa		

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

District of Columbia

District of Columbia			
Center for Biologic	al Diversity		
Plaintiff)		
v.)	Civil Action No.	
Gina McCarthy			
Defendant	.)		
	SUMMONS IN A	CIVIL ACTION	
To: (Defendant's name and address)	ERIC H. HOLDER, JR. Attor U.S. Department of Justice 950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N Washington, D.C. 20530-000	I.W.	
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.		
are the United States or a Unite P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	d States agency, or an officer serve on the plaintiff an answ		
If you fail to respond, j You also must file your answer	•	stered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.	
		ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT	
Date:			
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk	

AO 440 (Rev. 12/09; DC 03/10) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (nan	ne of individual and title, if any)			
was re	ceived by me on (date)				
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individua	al at (place)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summons	at the individual's residence o	r usual place of abode with (name)		
		, a perso	n of suitable age and discretion who resid	des there,	
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy t	to the individual's last known address; or		
	☐ I served the summo	ons on (name of individual)		,	who is
	designated by law to a	accept service of process on be	chalf of (name of organization)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the summ	mons unexecuted because			; or
	☐ Other (specify):				
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00) .
	I declare under penalty	y of perjury that this information	on is true.		
Date:			Server's signature		
			server's signature		
			Printed name and title		
			The same and the		
			Server's address		
			Deiver a uuuresa		

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

District of Columbia

District of Columbia				
Center for Biologic	al Diversity)		
Plaintiff))		
v.) Civil Action No.		
Gina McCa	arthy))		
Defendan	t)		
	SUMMONS IN	A CIVIL ACTION		
To: (Defendant's name and address)	Gina McCarthy, Administra U.S. Environmental Protect Ariel Rios Building 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., I Washington, D.C. 20004	ction Agency		
A lawsuit has been file	d against you.			
are the United States or a Unite P. 12 (a)(2) or (3) — you must	ed States agency, or an office serve on the plaintiff an ans			
If you fail to respond, j You also must file your answer	-	entered against you for the relief demanded in the complaint.		
		ANGELA D. CAESAR, CLERK OF COURT		
Date:				
		Signature of Clerk or Deputy Clerk		

AO 440 (Rev. 12/09; DC 03/10) Summons in a Civil Action (Page 2)

Civil Action No.

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 4 (l))

	This summons for (nan	me of individual and title, if any)			
was re	ceived by me on (date)	·			
	☐ I personally served	the summons on the individual	at (place)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I left the summons		usual place of abode with (name)		
		, a person	of suitable age and discretion who resid	des there,	
	on (date)	, and mailed a copy to	the individual's last known address; or		
		ons on (name of individual)		, ,	who is
	designated by law to	accept service of process on beh	alf of (name of organization)		
			on (date)	; or	
	☐ I returned the sum	mons unexecuted because			; or
	☐ Other (specify):				
	My fees are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00	
	I declare under penalt	y of perjury that this information	n is true.		
Date:			Server's signature		
			Printed name and title		
			Server's address		

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc: